
Appendix 2 – Supplementary Reports

MTC has published several supplementary reports in conjunction with the *Transportation 2035 Plan*. These include an *Environmental Impact Report*, a *Project Notebook*, and other topic-specific reports listed here. These reports are available online at www.mtc.ca.gov, and in the MTC-ABAG Library. The reports also can be ordered via e-mail at library@mtc.ca.gov, or by contacting the MTC-ABAG Library by phone at (510) 817-5836.

Environmental Impact Report for the Transportation 2035 Plan

MTC, April 2009

As the lead agency, MTC prepared an *Environmental Impact Report* (EIR) for the Transportation 2035 Plan pursuant to the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).

The EIR presents a regionwide assessment of potential impacts of the Transportation 2035 Plan. Areas of evaluation include: transportation; air quality; climate change and greenhouse gases; land use, housing and social environment; energy; geology and seismicity; noise; and biological, water, visual and cultural resources. Measures to mitigate any significant adverse regional impacts identified in the analysis of

the Transportation 2035 Plan are recommended. A reasonable range of alternatives to the Transportation 2035 Plan is considered, and an environmentally superior alternative among the alternatives analyzed is evaluated. This EIR does not evaluate the site-specific impacts of individual projects, which will be analyzed in subsequent project-level EIRs performed by project sponsors.

Comments on the scope of the environmental analysis and EIR alternatives were solicited through the Notice of Preparation issued on February 19, 2008. Two public/agency scoping meetings were held on March 10 and March 13, 2008. Of the three government-to-government consultations held between federally recognized Tribal governments and MTC, the Association of Bay Area Governments and Caltrans District 4, the October 2008 meeting focused on a review of the proposed North Bay transportation projects and a discussion of environmental issues to be considered in the EIR. In addition, upon request, one-on-one consultations between the Federated Indians of Graton Rancheria, MTC and Caltrans were held on March 21, 2008 and October 15, 2008. On November 12, 2008, a discussion on draft mitigations was held with

federal, state and Tribal land management, wildlife and regulatory agencies. MTC also held two public hearings, on January 27 and January 28, 2009, to solicit comments on the EIR.

A draft EIR was released for a 45-day public review period in December 2008. The Commission reviewed and considered this environmental assessment prior to taking action on the plan. The Commission certified the final EIR on April 22, 2009. An executive summary of the impacts and mitigations of the Transportation 2035 Plan is included in the EIR and is incorporated in the Transportation 2035 Plan in full by reference.

Transportation Air Quality Conformity Analysis

MTC, April 2009

The *Transportation Air Quality Conformity Analysis* is a conformity assessment of both the Transportation 2035 Plan and Amendment 09-06 to the 2009 Transportation Improvement Program (TIP).

The purpose of a conformity assessment is to demonstrate that the transportation activities in the long-range plan and/or TIP will not cause

new air quality violations, worsen existing violations, or delay timely attainment of relevant national ambient air quality standards. A conformity finding means that the total motor vehicle emissions projected for a plan and/or TIP are within the emissions limits (“budgets”) established in the latest State Implementation Plan, and that transportation control measures are implemented in a timely fashion.

This *Conformity Analysis* is prepared in accordance with the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency’s (EPA) air quality conformity regulations and with the Bay Area Transportation Air Quality Conformity Protocol (MTC Resolution No. 3757), which has been approved by U.S. EPA as the Conformity State Implementation Plan (SIP) for the Bay Area.

A *Draft Transportation Air Quality Conformity Analysis* was released for a 30-day public review period in January 2009. The Commission approved the conformity determination on April 22, 2009. The Federal Highway Administration and Federal Transit Administration subsequently issued their joint approval of the conformity determination on May 29, 2009.

Project Notebook

MTC, May 2009

The *Project Notebook* provides additional, detailed technical information on Transportation 2035 investments for staff at MTC and its partner agencies, as well as other interested organizations and individuals. The *Project Notebook* covers the transit operating and capital shortfalls, local streets and roads shortfalls, financial assumptions, and MTC’s system efficiency programs. It also provides project-level details on the transportation projects and programs in the financially constrained Transportation 2035 Plan.

Public Outreach and Involvement Program Report

MTC, May 2009

MTC joined with partner agencies, particularly the Association of Bay Area Governments (ABAG), to gather public input for development of the Transportation 2035 Plan. An extensive public outreach and involvement program for the Transportation 2035 Plan was conducted in three phases over a two year period.

Phase One: Vision and Goals

MTC launched the Transportation 2035 planning effort in early 2007, with a focus on defining the region’s vision and goals. This was

followed, in broad strokes, by identification of those policies and investment strategies that would be needed to carry out that vision, and for substantially reducing congestion and the main Bay Area contributor to global warming, carbon dioxide emissions (CO₂) from cars and other sources.

The public involvement campaign began with discussions at the monthly meetings of MTC’s three advisory committees. In addition, three regional forums were held in June 2007: an evening public workshop that was attended by about 85 residents; a joint workshop for members of MTC’s three advisory committees; and a roundtable discussion with MTC’s chair and leaders of economic, environmental and social equity organizations in the Bay Area.

A statistically valid public opinion survey was conducted in the fall of 2007. The telephone poll questioned (in English, Cantonese or Spanish) 1,800 randomly selected adult residents of the nine-county Bay Area about their concern for air quality and global warming, their assessment of a range of transportation-related priorities, and their attitudes toward land use — an increasingly important factor in transportation planning. The poll had a margin of error of +/- 2.3 percent.

Additionally, a Web survey mirrored the telephone poll. The Web survey was completed by nearly 2,000 respondents.

Also in the fall of 2007, a regional forum jointly sponsored by MTC and ABAG brought together some 700 participants from every corner of the region, including public sector staff, community and environmental advocates, elected officials, business people, and concerned citizens, who participated in discussions of strategies for substantially reducing congestion and carbon dioxide emissions (CO₂). At the forum, the various proposals were subjected to a reality check via panel discussions by experts and local officials, break-out sessions, and on-the-spot electronic polling.

To gather additional qualitative data to help guide the Transportation 2035 effort, a series of evening public stakeholder meetings were held in November 2007, at three locations around the region. These were attended by some 115 residents.

Also in late November and early December 2007, more than 200 “person-on-the-street” interviews were conducted over a three-week period with members of the public who do not typically attend public meetings regarding transportation. These brief, five-to-10-minute interviews — conducted at public gathering places (such as colleges, farmers’ markets, tran-

sit hubs and shopping centers) in all nine Bay Area counties — were designed to gather opinions on key questions relating to transportation revenue and pricing, climate protection, as well as transportation and land use. The 35-plus interview sites represented a broad cross section of demographics within the MTC service area. Bilingual staff members facilitated participation from Spanish- and Chinese-speaking residents.

Members of the public, cities, counties and partner agencies also were invited to submit possible projects for consideration for inclusion in the long-range plan. Projects had to have a public sponsor and conform to MTC guidelines; proposals were submitted to the appropriate county congestion management agency for an initial screening. MTC hosted a regional workshop in January 2008 to brief sponsors on the online application process, which had a March 2008 deadline.

Phase Two: Investment Tradeoffs

In March 2008, the Commission gave provisional approval to a set of Transportation 2035 Vision Policy Strategies that would serve to influence the ensuing investment tradeoff discussions and inform the project evaluation process. Discussions on the investment tradeoffs inherent in developing the 25-year plan formed the core of the second phase of the public involvement effort.

The Phase Two public involvement campaign began in January 2008 with the first in a series of six monthly Joint Advisor Workshops held with members of MTC’s three citizen advisory committees. The joint advisor workshops continued through the month of June and provided an opportunity for the Commission’s advisors, who represent a broad cross-section of the region’s stakeholders, to weigh in on the investment tradeoffs facing the Commission.

In the spring of 2008, MTC launched a second statistically valid telephone poll of 3,600 registered voters (400 in each of the nine Bay Area counties). Over the course of several weeks the telephone poll was offered in English, Spanish and Cantonese, and had a margin of error of +/- 1.6 percent.

In addition to the telephone poll, the public involvement campaign included a series of nine public workshops, one in each of the Bay Area counties, with on-the-spot electronic voting, as well as a Web survey and numerous focus groups. Held in May 2008, the workshops drew over 450 attendees who recorded their opinions via live electronic voting with instantaneous results. In addition to gauging public opinion on the investment tradeoffs, the electronic voting included several questions testing respondents knowledge of transportation facts, so that the meetings provided some context for and served to educate participants.

A 12-minute video — titled *Change in Motion* — shown at the May 2008 workshops provided an overview of the challenges that must be addressed by the Transportation 2035 Plan. A Web survey patterned after the workshop electronic voting was available on the MTC Web site from June 3, 2008, through July 8, 2008, and yielded a total of 1,083 completed responses.

Simultaneous with the outreach workshops, MTC conducted nine focus groups (one per county) to discuss potential investment packages with some 100 Bay Area residents who were contacted as part of the spring 2008 telephone poll. MTC also contracted with 10 community-based organizations for assistance in conducting focus groups in low-income communities and communities of color throughout the Bay Area. An additional 150 residents recruited by the community organizations participated in these focus groups; depending on the community, translators were available for Spanish, Cantonese or Vietnamese speakers.

The public comment fed into the development of a preferred Transportation 2035 investment package approved by the Commission in July 2008.

Phase Three: Draft and Final Transportation 2035 Plans

The investment package was subjected to technical analyses and incorporated into a *Draft Transportation 2035 Plan* released for public comment in December 2008. During this final phase of public involvement, MTC held two public hearings, on January 27 and January 28, 2009, and several meetings with stakeholders, including MTC's citizen advisors, to solicit comments on the draft plan. MTC received numerous items of written correspondence, and prepared written responses to each one. This information was presented to the Commission for its consideration prior to Commission action on the long-range plan.

Travel Forecasts Data Summary

MTC, December 2008

The *Travel Forecasts Data Summary* documents the modeling assumptions and travel and air quality forecasts prepared for the Transportation 2035 Plan and its supplementary technical reports. The data in this report are presented in the *Equity Analysis Report*, the *Transportation Air Quality Conformity Analysis*, the *Environmental Impact Report for the Transportation 2035 Plan*, the *Performance Assessment Report*, and the *Bay Area High-Occupancy Toll (HOT) Network Study*. The data summary includes:

- socio-economic forecasts such as population, employment and land use
- pricing assumptions such as the costs of gas, parking and bridge tolls
- transportation network assumptions regarding the supply of roads and transit
- trip generation and distribution characteristics such as the number of daily trips and distribution of trip purposes
- mode choice characteristics regarding how many people travel by automobile, by transit, by bicycle and by foot
- traffic characteristics such as the levels of congestion and delay on roadways
- affordability of transportation among different income levels
- air quality forecasts, such as emissions of pollutants regulated by federal and state laws

Equity Analysis Report

MTC, February 2009

The *Equity Analysis Report* is intended to measure both the benefits and burdens associated with the transportation investment alternatives included in the Transportation 2035 Plan, and to make sure that minority and low-income communities share equitably in the benefits of the plan's investments without bearing a disproportionate share of the burdens.

The *Equity Analysis Report* compares the impacts of the Transportation 2035 Plan's investment alternatives on the Bay Area's low-income and minority communities, relative to the remainder of the region. Five equity indicators are included in the analysis. One indicator evaluates the plan's financial investments, and four indicators measure forecasted outcomes, derived from MTC's travel model for the horizon year 2035. These four indicators are:

- access to low-income jobs
- access to non-work activities (such as shopping, school and recreational trips)
- vehicle emissions
- affordability (an experimental test measure)

MTC's Minority Citizens Advisory Committee convened a Transportation 2035 Equity Analysis Subcommittee to review the Equity Analysis methodology, provide input on refinements to the measures used in past equity analyses, and make recommendations for future enhancements. Meetings were held periodically throughout 2008 and were open to interested stakeholders and the public.

An April 2009 addendum to this report was prepared to incorporate updated financial information presented in the adopted Transportation 2035 Plan.

Performance Assessment Report

MTC, December 2008

Three performance-based analyses informed development of the Transportation 2035 Plan. These are described below and detailed in the *Performance Assessment Report*.

1) Vision Scenario Assessment

This effort, undertaken in fall 2007, was intended to answer the question "What would it take to meet the Transportation 2035 performance objectives?" MTC tested three ambitious investment packages: a) a program of freeway operations and management investments; b) a regional network of HOT lanes complemented by extensive bus enhancements; and c) an extensive program of rail and ferry expansion. Because the investment approaches did not come close to achieving the called-for reductions, MTC also tested aggressive focused-growth and transportation pricing scenarios. The lessons learned in this assessment include:

- Infrastructure alone does not help us reach our targets, though management of freeway operations is effective for congestion relief.
- Pricing has a much larger effect.
- Focused growth helps us reach targets in the longer term.
- Technology advances and behavior changes are needed.

2) Project Performance Assessment

The purpose of this analysis, conducted in spring 2008, was to inform the selection of individual investments in the financially constrained portion of the plan. The assessment consists of both qualitative and quantitative analyses that build on the plan's policy foundation. In the qualitative assessment, MTC reviewed all candidate investments for discretionary funding with respect to their support for key Transportation 2035 policy tenets. In the quantitative evaluation, MTC estimated the benefit-cost ratio and cost-effectiveness of a subset of 60 higher-cost projects and programs. The analysis identified outliers, both positive and negative, with respect to the plan's policies and performance objectives. This information comprised one set of factors the Commission considered in proposing a financially constrained program of investments.

3) Proposed Investment Performance Assessment

This analysis assesses the degree to which the Transportation 2035 Plan is expected to help the region progress toward the performance objectives. As presaged by the Vision Scenario Assessment, the financially constrained program itself is not sufficient to meet the objectives. To do so, the region will need to pursue further policy actions, partnerships and advocacy platforms.

Government-to-Government Consultation With Native American Tribes

MTC, June 2009

As required by state and federal law, MTC conducted government-to-government consultations with federally recognized Tribal governments during preparation of the Transportation 2035 Plan. MTC, Caltrans District 4 and the Association of Bay Area Governments (ABAG) hosted three meetings for Bay Area Tribal governments: June 2007, February 2008 and October 2008. The meetings included status reports on the development of the Transportation 2035 Plan, ABAG's FOCUS effort and Caltrans' planning activities. These forums provided an opportunity to open lines of communication with Tribal leaders on these planning efforts.

Additionally, MTC met twice with one federally-recognized tribe that requested one-on-one consultations to discuss how the Transportation 2035 Plan affected its Tribal lands. These meetings were held in March 2008 and October 2008.

This report includes materials and notes from the meetings with the Tribal governments through each phase of Transportation 2035 Plan development.